

Plus Obligations in WTO Law

Dissertation
zur Erlangung des Grades einer Doktorin
des Rechts der Rechtswissenschaftlichen Fakultät
der Universität des Saarlandes

vorgelegt von

Yulin He

Tag der Disputation: 8. März 2017

Dekan: Univ.-Prof. Dr. Roland Michael Beckmann

Erstberichterstatter: Univ.-Prof. Dr. Marc Bungenberg

Zweitberichterstatter: Univ.-Prof. Dr. Torsten Stein

Berichte aus der Rechtswissenschaft

Yulin He

Plus Obligations in WTO Law

Shaker Verlag
Aachen 2017

Bibliographic information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available in the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>.

Zugl.: Saarbrücken, Univ., Diss., 2017

Copyright Shaker Verlag 2017

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publishers.

Printed in Germany.

ISBN 978-3-8440-5252-7

ISSN 0945-098X

Shaker Verlag GmbH • P.O. BOX 101818 • D-52018 Aachen

Phone: 0049/2407/9596-0 • Telefax: 0049/2407/9596-9

Internet: www.shaker.de • e-mail: info@shaker.de

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Table of contents	I
Abbreviations	IV
Introduction	1
A. Plus obligations within WTO	2
I. Origin	2
II. Scope and definition	9
III. Minus or Plus?	14
B. Comprehensive survey of plus obligations within WTO	20
I. Economic Policies	20
1. State ownership and state-trading entities; privatization	20
a. State ownership and state-trading entities	20
b. Privatization	24
2. Pricing policies	24
3. Non-Discrimination	26
II. Framework for making and enforcing policies	29
1. Judicial review	29
2. Uniform administration	31
III. Policies affecting trade in goods	36
1. Trading rights	36
2. Import regulations	39
a. Fees and charges for services rendered	39
b. Customs valuation	40
3. Export regulations	42
4. Internal policies affecting foreign trade in goods	44
a. Trade-related investment measures	44
b. Sanitary and Phytosanitary Measures	47
c. Trade in civil aircraft	47
IV. Trade-related intellectual property regime	48

V.	Policies affecting trade in services	49
VI.	Transparency	50
VII.	Transitional review	54
VIII.	Summary	57
C.	Challenges of WTO-Plus obligations.....	62
I.	Legal enforceability of WTO-Plus obligations through the DSU	62
II.	Relationship between plus obligations and other WTO rules	68
1.	Relationship with other Multilateral Trade Agreements	69
2.	Relationship with WTO baseline.....	69
3.	Relationship with the exception rules in the WTO agreements	73
a.	The availability of “general exceptions” in <i>China-Publications and Audiovisual Products</i>	74
b.	The availability of “general exceptions” in <i>China-Raw Materials</i>	76
c.	Comparison of the two disputes.....	78
d.	Suggestion.....	87
4.	Relationship with similar commitments set out in other members’ Accession Protocol.....	91
a.	Impacts on the interpretation of similar plus obligations.....	92
b.	Impacts on future WTO accession negotiations	99
III.	Summary	102
D.	The future of WTO-Plus obligations.....	105
I.	The reasons behind the WTO-Plus obligations and the impacts on the future development of the WTO	105
1.	Why do existing members require WTO-Plus obligations.....	106
a.	Implementation assurance.....	106
b.	Special interests of existing WTO Members under the “Single Undertaking”	108
2.	Why do acceding members accept WTO-Plus obligations	113
a.	Benefits of the WTO.....	113
b.	Balance between costs and benefits	115
c.	Promoting domestic reforms.....	118
d.	Demands from existing WTO Members.....	119

3.	The impacts of plus obligations on the future development of the WTO	122
a.	Negative impacts	122
b.	Positive impacts	128
II.	The possibility of reform	131
1.	The amendment to WTO-Plus obligations	131
a.	Legal nature of WTO-Plus obligations	131
b.	The amendment of plus obligations as bilateral agreement.....	134
c.	The amendment of plus obligations as multilateral agreement.....	135
2.	Renegotiation of plus obligations in the WTO.....	140
III.	Future developments for plus obligations	147
1.	Existing plus obligations	148
a.	Adopt authoritative interpretations	148
b.	Adopt guidelines to clarify the relationship.....	148
c.	Enable the entire WTO Members to observe plus obligations	150
2.	Future plus obligations	151
a.	Define the relationship between plus obligations and other WTO multilateral agreements in future WTO accession.....	151
b.	Adopt guidelines for future accessions	152
c.	Provide adequate and impartial technical assistance to acceding members	153
E.	Conclusion.....	158
	Annex 1	164
	Bibliography.....	166