

Berichte aus der Psychologie

**Hermann Rodenhausen**

**Semantic and Syntactic Levels  
of Mathematical Thinking and Learning**

Theoretical Concepts  
Empirical Results

Shaker Verlag  
Aachen 2009

**Bibliographic information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek**

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available in the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>.

Copyright Shaker Verlag 2009

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publishers.

Printed in Germany.

ISBN 978-3-8322-8332-2

ISSN 0945-0971

Shaker Verlag GmbH • P.O. BOX 101818 • D-52018 Aachen

Phone: 0049/2407/9596-0 • Telefax: 0049/2407/9596-9

Internet: [www.shaker.de](http://www.shaker.de) • e-mail: [info@shaker.de](mailto:info@shaker.de)

# Acknowledgements

I am grateful to *Gert H. Müller*, *H. Jerome Keisler*, and *Steven C. Kleene* for ambitiously introducing me to the field of mathematical logic, to *Dietrich Albert* for leading me to a substantial understanding of cognitive psychology and the principles of empirical methodology, particularly sensibilizing for the significant potentials of interdisciplinary cooperation, to *Hans Joachim Burscheid* and *Horst Struve* for supporting my interests in mathematical methodology beyond the scope of logical formalization, to *Erhard Anthes*, *Hartmut Göhner*, *Wolfgang Gräßle*, *Jens Holger Lorenz*, *Jürgen Schönbeck*, *Horst Struve*, *Klaus Volkert* for their invaluable support in conducting the experiments, to *Petra Wachter* for substantial assistance in the preparation of the manuscript, and to the *Studienstiftung des Deutschen Volkes*, which, through a series of grants, gave me the opportunity to pursue my interests, rather unconventionally, in stimulating surroundings.

Heidelberg, April 2009

Hermann Rodenhausen



# Table of Contents

<b>Introduction.....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>1 The Paradigm of Compatibility Judgment.....</b>	<b>9</b>
1.1 The Influence of Semantic Aspects on Relational Reasoning.....	10
1.1.1 Introduction .....	10
1.1.2 Formal Structure of Sentences .....	11
1.1.3 Method.....	13
1.1.4 Results .....	14
1.1.5 Discussion.....	20
1.2 Explaining Ordering Effects in Compatibility Judgment by Mental Models .....	22
1.2.1 Introduction .....	22
1.2.2 Formal Structure of Sentences .....	23
1.2.3 Method.....	29
1.2.4 Results .....	31
1.2.5 Discussion.....	37
1.3 The Atmosphere Effect in Compatibility Judgment .....	38
1.3.1 Introduction .....	39
1.3.2 Method.....	39
1.3.3 Results .....	41
1.3.4 Discussion.....	43
<b>2 The Paradigm of Sentence Negation .....</b>	<b>45</b>
2.1 Is Negating Sentences a Semantic or Syntactic Process?.....	46
2.1.1 Introduction .....	47
2.1.2 Formal Structure of Sentences .....	47
2.1.3 Method.....	51
2.1.4 Results .....	53
2.1.5 Discussion.....	64

2.2	The Influence of Predicate Types on the Effect of Truth Bias.....	68
2.2.1	Introduction .....	68
2.2.2	Formal Structure of Sentences .....	69
2.2.3	Method.....	70
2.2.4	Results .....	71
2.2.5	Discussion.....	74
2.3	The Truth Bias in Sentence Completion Tasks .....	75
2.3.1	Introduction .....	75
2.3.2	Method.....	76
2.3.3	Results .....	78
2.3.4	Discussion.....	82
<b>3</b>	<b>Misconceptions in Elementary Algebra.....</b>	<b>85</b>
3.1	Distinguishing Semantic and Syntactic Levels of Task Comprehension .....	86
3.1.1	Introduction .....	86
3.1.2	Method.....	87
3.1.3	Results .....	89
3.1.4	Discussion.....	94
3.2	Structural Analysis of Misconceptions .....	96
3.2.1	Introduction .....	96
3.2.2	Method.....	98
3.2.3	Hierarchically Structured Sets of Test Questions .....	101
3.2.4	Results .....	103
3.2.5	Discussion.....	109
<b>4</b>	<b>The Role of Language in Logical Problem Solving.....</b>	<b>113</b>
4.1	Matching Graphical and Formal Levels of Representation.....	114
4.1.1	Introduction .....	114
4.1.2	Formal Semantics .....	116
4.1.3	Method.....	119
4.1.4	Results and Discussion .....	122
4.1.5	General Discussion .....	133

**5 Summary and Outlook..... 137**

**References ..... 145**