Development of a Process and Performance Oriented Reference Model to Integrate 3rd Party Logistics Providers into Supply Chains

Von der Fakultät für Maschinenwesen der
Rheinisch-Westfälischen Technischen Hochschule Aachen
zur Erlangung des akademischen Grades eines
Doktors der Ingenieurwissenschaften genehmigte Dissertation

vorgelegt von:
Amit Garg

Berichter:
Univ.-Prof. Dr.-Ing. Dipl.-Wirt. Ing. Günther Schuh
Uni.-Prof. em. Dr.-Ing. Dipl.-Wirt. Ing. Dr. h. c. mult. Walter Eversheim

Tag der mündlichen Prüfung: 8th January 2010

Schriftenreihe Rationalisierung und Humanisierung

Band 99

Amit Garg

Development of a Process and Performance Oriented Reference Model to Integrate 3rd Party Logistics Providers into Supply Chains

Shaker Verlag
Aachen 2010

Bibliographic information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek
The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available in the Internet at http://dnb.d-nb.de.

Zugl.: D 82 (Diss. RWTH Aachen University, 2010)

Copyright Shaker Verlag 2010
All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publishers.

Printed in Germany.

ISBN 978-3-8322-9086-3
ISSN 1434-8519

Shaker Verlag GmbH • P.O. BOX 101818 • D-52018 Aachen
Phone: 0049/2407/9596-0 • Telefax: 0049/2407/9596-9
Internet: www.shaker.de • e-mail: info@shaker.de

Acknowledgement

The research that has gone into this thesis has been thoroughly enjoyable. That enjoyment is largely a result of the interaction that I have had with my supervisors, colleagues and numerous 3PL providers who voluntarily supported me in my research. I could never have done any of this, particularly the research and writing that went into this dissertation, without the support and encouragement of a lot of people whom I would like to acknowledge.

A very important ingredient of the research and writing process has been the guidance from my supervisor. I feel very privileged to have worked with Prof. Dr.-Ing. Dipl.-Wirt.-Ing. Günther Schuh and owe him a great debt of gratitude for his patience, inspiration and guidance as I hovered between hope and despair. I am very thankful to Prof. Dr.-Ing. Walter Eversheim for agreeing to co-supervise my research work and to Prof. Dr.-Ing. Jörg Feldhusen for chairing the examination committee and for supporting me in my overall Ph.D. program.

It is difficult to overstate my gratitude to Dr.-Ing. Stich, Volker, Managing Director FIR and member of my Ph.D. examination committee. This appreciation extends beyond the academic setting. It is to an advisor and a supervisor who gave me much more than I ever expected during my stay at FIR. Your exceptional support at all times from day one until today has played an instrumental role in shaping my career and I remain humbly indebted to you for everything.

I would like to thank wholeheartedly my friends and colleagues at FIR and research partners from EU project InCoCo-S who supported me in the different stages of Ph.D. process. Especially I would like to thank Dr. Carsten Schmidt for his never-ending support with my dissertation, Herbert Heinzel for his guidance and innovative ideas in structuring the model and Dr. Hendrik Hoeck for his persistence to conclude this work. In addition I would like to thank Tobias Brosze and Henrik Wienholdt for their patience with my final Doctor Presentation and Oliver Salhani and Rene Kullick who intensively supported me for years in developing and validating the 3PL model.

In addition, I am very thankful to my colleagues and best friends Dr. Andreas Gierth and Dr. Heiko Dirlenbach for their support and cooperation in all spheres of my personal and professional activities during my stay at FIR and in Germany. You were instrumental in helping me find my research direction and in helping me get past all the self-doubting that inevitably crops up in the course of a Ph.D. You were the first person I turn to in good times and in bad. You have given me the courage to make the next transitions in my life. For all of this, I thank you both once again.

Finally, I would like to thank my family for keeping me inspired and committed during the whole process inspite of all odds. My parents and my sister have given me their unequivocal support throughout, as always, for which my mere expression of thanks likewise does not suffice. This work would not have seen the light of day without the utmost commitment and endurance from my wife Sheetu and true sportsmanship from my two-year-old son Arnav. I thank my family for their time and enthusiasm and dedicate this thesis with full honors to them.

Aachen, 5th February 2010 Amit Garg

Contents at a Glance

Contents at a Glance		iii
Table of Contents		iv
List of Figures		ix
Abbreviations		xii
1	Introduction	1
2	Definition of Terminology and Research Scope	7
3	State of the Art Analysis	27
4	Research Methodology for the Development of a Model	53
5	Development of Process Reference Model for 3PL Services	78
6	Development of a Performance Measurement System for 3PL Services	100
7	Validation of 3PL Reference Model through Expert Interviews	119
8	Implementation of the 3PL Reference Model	154
9	Conclusions and Outlook for Future	170
Bibliography		175
Appendix		187

Table of Contents

Contents at a Glance iii

Table of Contents iv

List of Figures ix

Abbreviations xii

1 Introduction 1

1.1 Outsourcing of Logistics to 3PL Service Providers as a Business Strategy 1

1.2 Key Business Challenges associated with Outsourcing Logistics to 3PL 2

1.3 Identifying Research Gap for the 3PL Domain 3

1.4 Structure of Thesis Work 5

2 Definition of Terminology and Research Scope 7

2.1 Supply Chain and Supply Chain Management 7

2.2 Services 8

2.2.1 Defining Services 8

2.2.2 Characteristics of Services 9

2.2.3 Service Classification and Business Related Services 10

2.3 Third Party Logistic Service as a Business Related Service 11

2.3.1 Transportation and Distribution Services 14

2.3.2 Warehousing Services 14

2.3.3 Value Added Services in Third Party Logistics 15

2.3.4 Customer for Third Party Logistics Services 16

2.3.5 Value in Third Party Logistic Services 17

2.4 Reference Models 18

2.4.1 Classification of Reference Models 19

2.4.2 Characterization of Reference Model 20

2.5 Business Process Modelling 23

2.5.1 Processes (1st BPM Element) 23

2.5.2 Information Flow as ‘Input’ and ‘Output’ (2nd BPM Element) 24

2.5.3 Key Performance Indicators (3rd BPM Element) 25

2.5.4 Best Practices (4th BPM Element) 25

2.6 Boundaries for Research Work 26

3 State of the Art Analysis 27

3.1 Process Oriented Reference Models for Supply Chains 27

3.1.1 Aachen Model of PPC 28

3.1.2 Supply Chain Operations Reference Model 28

3.1.3 Global Supply Chain Forum Framework 29
3.1.4 Value Chain Reference Model 30
3.1.5 Logistic Processes from LogiBEST / VDI 4400 – 3 31
3.2 Process Oriented Reference Models for Service Management 32
3.2.1 Service Delivery Reference Model 32
3.2.2 The Service Supply Chain Model 33
3.2.3 Izmir University of Economics – Supply Service Chain Model 34
3.3 Consolidated Review of Process Reference Models 36
3.4 Performance Measurement Systems for Supply Chains and Services 39
3.4.1 Balanced Scorecard 41
3.4.2 A Performance Measurement Framework for MNC's 42
3.4.3 Supply Chain Scorecard from the SCOR Model 43
3.4.4 Value Chain Card from the Value Chain Reference Model 44
3.4.5 VDI Standards on Logistic Performance 45
3.4.6 Transcorporate Logistics Performance Framework 47
3.4.7 Logistic Service Providers Framework 48
3.5 Consolidated Review of Performance Measurement Systems 49
4 Research Methodology for the Development of a Model 53
4.1 Research Approaches 53
4.1.1 Retrieval and Enhancement of Existing Reference Model 54
4.1.2 New Development of Reference Model 56
4.1.3 Selection of the Research Methodology 56
4.2 Elaboration of Schütte Method for the Development of Reference Model 57
4.2.1 Problem Definition – Phase 1 58
4.2.1.1 Problem Definition through Reference Model Characteristic Morphology 58
4.2.2 Construction of Modelling Framework – Phase 2 59
4.2.2.1 Selection of Relevant Reference Models 59
4.2.2.2 Selection of a Modelling Language and Tool 60
4.2.3 Development of Reference Model – Phase 3 61
4.2.3.1 System Theory 62
4.2.3.2 Review of System Theory and Grounded Theory Methodology 63
4.2.3.3 Grounded Theory Methodology 64
4.2.3.4 Case Study as Research Method 66
4.2.4 Consolidation of Reference Model – Phase 4 68
4.2.5 Application of Reference Model – Phase 5 68

4.3 Deploying 3-Phase Model Development Approach for 3PL Reference Model 69
4.3.1 Reference Model Characterization – 1st Phase 69
4.3.2 Specification of Development Framework – 2nd Phase 71
4.3.2.1 Selection of Relevant Reference Models 71
4.3.2.1 Selection of a Modelling Language and Tool 74
4.3.3 Development of Reference Model – 3rd Phase 74
4.4 Evaluation of Quality of the Reference Model 76
4.5 Conclusion 77
5 Development of Process Reference Model for 3PL Services 78
5.1 Customer Key Processes on Outsourcing to 3PL Service Provider 78
5.2 Developing Process Framework for 3PL Provider 80
5.2.1 Adapting Service Supply Chain Framework to 3PL Domain 81
5.2.2 Designing Processes for 3PL Services 83
5.2.2.1 High Level Processes for 3PL Provider 84
5.2.2.2 Interactions between Key Processes of Customer and 3PL Provider 86
5.2.3 Elaboration of Adapt / Build / Operate Phase for 3PL Services 87
5.2.3.1 Lifecycle Approach of 3PL Model 88
5.2.3.2 Plan Phase for 3PL Service Provider 88
5.2.3.3 Adapt Phase for 3PL Service Provider 89
5.2.3.4 Build Phase for 3PL Service Provider 91
5.2.3.5 Operate Phase for 3PL Service Provider 93
5.3 Conclusions 97
6 Development of a Performance Measurement System for 3PL Services 100
6.1 Essential Characteristics of a PMS System 100
6.2 Developing the Framework for 3PL Performance Measurement System 101
6.3 Identifying Key Performance Attributes for 3PL Services 103
6.4 Developing Key Performance Indicators for 3PL Services 107
6.4.1 Service Reliability 107
6.4.2 Service Responsiveness 110
6.4.3 Service Flexibility 111
6.4.4 Service Cost 112
6.4.5 Assets Management 113
6.4.6 Innovation 114
6.4.7 IT Utilization 114
6.4.8 Coordination 115

6.4.9 Collaboration 116
6.5 Conclusions 116
7 Validation of 3PL Reference Model through Expert Interviews 119
7.1 Development of the Expert Interview Approach for Validations 119
7.1.1 Selection of the 3PL Service Providers for Expert Interview 120
7.1.2 Structuring Expert Interview and Questionnaire 121
7.2 Profile of the 3PL Providers Participating in Expert Interviews 123
7.3 Feedback on the Processes within 3PL Reference Model 124
7.3.1 Feedback on Adapt Phase 125
7.3.2 Feedback on Build Phase 128
7.3.3 Feedback on Operate Phase 131
7.3.4 Feedback on Support Processes 135
7.4 Feedback on PMS within 3PL Model 138
7.4.1 Developing Ecological KPIs for 'Environmental Sustainability' 138
7.4.2 Feedback on Service Adapted to Customer Satisfaction (K01) 141
7.4.3 Feedback on Service Build to Customer Satisfaction (K02) 142
7.4.4 Feedback on Perfect Order Fulfilment (K03) 143
7.4.5 Feedback on Service Management Cycle Time (K04) 143
7.4.6 Feedback on Customer Order Cycle Time (K05) 143
7.4.7 Feedback on Flexibility in Assets Utilization (K06) 144
7.4.8 Feedback on Service Chain Cost – Adapt Services (KA7) 144
7.4.9 Feedback on Service Chain Cost – Build Services (KB7) 144
7.4.10 Feedback on Service Chain Cost – Operate Services (KO7) 144
7.4.11 Feedback on Service Sales (K08) 145
7.4.12 Feedback on Efficiency in Assets Utilization (K09) 145
7.4.13 Feedback on ROI^2 – Return on Innovation Investment (K10) 146
7.4.14 Feedback on Percentage of Information Technology Utilization (K11) 146
7.4.15 Feedback on Level and Degree of Information Sharing (K12) 147
7.4.16 Feedback on Buyer – Vendor Cost Savings (K13) 147
7.4.17 Feedback on Energy and Resource Consumed (K14) 147
7.4.18 Feedback on Degree of Environmental Pollution (K15) 148
7.4.19 Feedback on Degree of Noise Pollution (K16) 149
7.4.20 Feedback on Health and Safety Index (K17) 149
7.5 Summary of the Validation of 3PL Reference Model through Expert Interviews 151
8 Implementation of the 3PL Reference Model 154

8.1 Developing a Performance Measurement System for Cordes & Simon GmbH 155
8.1.1 AS-IS Business Scenario 'COSI' 155
8.1.2 Key Business Challenges and Goals for Implementing 3PL Model 156
8.1.3 Development of Service Scorecard for COSI 3PL Services 156
8.1.4 Implementation of Service Scorecard 159
8.2 Developing Business Processes for a new Customer at G.L.Kayser 160
8.2.1 AS-IS Business Scenario – Process Overview 'GLK' 161
8.2.2 Key Business Challenges and Goals for Implementing 3PL Model 162
8.2.3 Development of Business Process for New Customer 162
8.2.4 Further Implementation of GLK Process Model 166
8.3 Conclusions and Lessons Learned from the Workshops 167
8.4 Standardization of 3PL Reference Model 169
9 Conclusions and Outlook for Future 170
9.1 Summary of Research Work Undertaken 170
9.2 Relevance of 3PL Model for the Practice and Outlook for Future 173
Bibliography 175
Appendix 187
Appendix A. Interview Questionnaire 187
Appendix B. 3PL Reference Model – Final Version 190
Appendix C. Repository of Business Processes in the 3PL Reference Model 192
Appendix D. PMS for 3PL Service Providers – Final Version 250
Appendix E. COSI Case Study: Service Scorecard for 3PL Services 262
Appendix F. GLK Case Study: AS-IS Business Process 267
Appendix G. Glossary of Input / Output Terms 281
Appendix H. Glossary of Best Practices 293
Appendix I. Glossary of Performance Metrics 300